IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA

STUDENTS FOR FAIR ADMISSIONS, * INC., *

*

Plaintiff, * Case No. 1:14CV954

*

VS.

November 19, 2020

UNIVERSITY OF NORTH CAROLINA, *
et al., *

* Volume 8
* Pages 1308-1374

Defendants. *

EXPEDITED TRANSCRIPT OF TRIAL (EXCLUDES CLOSING ARGUMENTS)

BEFORE THE HONORABLE LORETTA C. BIGGS UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE

APPEARANCES:

For Plaintiff: CONSOVOY MCCARTHY, PLLC

Thomas R. McCarthy, Esquire Patrick Strawbridge, Esquire James F. Hasson, Esquire Bryan K. Weir, Esquire

BELL DAVIS & PITT, P.A.

Daniel Alan M. Ruley, Esquire

For UNC Defendants: SKADDEN ARPS SLATE MEAGHER & FLOM, LLP

Patrick J. Fitzgerald, Esquire

Lara A. Flath, Esquire Amy L. Van Gelder, Esquire Marianne H. Combs, Esquire

NORTH CAROLINA DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE

Stephanie A. Brennan, Esquire Tamika Henderson, Esquire

For Intervenors: LAWYERS' COMMITTEE CIVIL RIGHTS UNDER LAW

David G. Hinojosa, Esquire

Genevieve Bonadies Torres, Esquire

NORTH CAROLINA JUSTICE CENTER Jack Holtzman, Esquire

Emily P. Turner, Esquire

1	INDEX	
2	DEFENDANT INTERVENORS' WITNESSES:	PAGE
3	HANNA WATSON Direct Examination by Mr. Holtzman	1311
4	LUIS ACOSTA	1011
5	Direct Examination by Mr. Hinojosa	1335
6	RIMEL MWAMBA	1255
7	Direct Examination by Ms. Turner	1355
8		
9		
10		
11		
12		
13		
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

1	PROCEEDINGS
2	THE COURT: Good morning.
3	MR. HASSAN: Good morning.
4	MR. HOLTZMAN: Good morning.
5	THE COURT: Are there any matters that we need to
6	address before we begin with witness testimony this morning?
7	MR. HASSAN: Not for the Plaintiff.
8	MR. HOLTZMAN: No, Your Honor.
9	THE COURT: No matters. All right. Let's call the
10	next witness, please.
11	MR. HOLTZMAN: Thank you, Your Honor. Jack Holtzman
12	with the North Carolina Justice Center. Our next witness is
13	Hanna Watson.
14	THE COURT: If we could have her sworn, please.
15	HANNA WATSON, INTERVENORS' WITNESS VIA VIDEO, SWORN
16	DIRECT EXAMINATION
17	BY MR. HOLTZMAN:
18	THE COURT: You can put your hand down. Thank you.
19	Q. Good morning, Ms. Watson.
20	A. Good morning.
21	Q. Can you hear me? Okay. Ms. Watson, can you state your
22	full name for the record?
23	A. Hanna Elizabeth Watson.
24	Q. And, Ms. Watson, please describe your educational
25	background for the Court.

- 1 A. Yes. I am a recent graduate of the University of North
- 2 | Carolina at Chapel Hill. I was there from August of 2016 until
- 3 | May of 2020, and I am currently a grad student at Princeton
- 4 | Theological Seminary.
- 5 | Q. Can you tell us what your GPA was when you graduated from
- 6 UNC?
- 7 \blacksquare A. Yes. My GPA was a 3.9.
- 8 \parallel Q. And in what -- what did you major and minor in?
- 9 A. I majored in African, African American, and diaspora
- 10 studies and minored in creative writing.
- 11 | Q. And did you receive any school recognition or honors while
- 12 you were at UNC?
- 13 A. Yes. I was a recipient of the Robert B. House Memorial
- 14 | Prize in poetry, and I was also a member of the Phi Beta Kappa
- 15 | Honors Society.
- 16 \parallel Q. Now, this case involves UNC's ability to consider race in
- 17 | admissions.
- 18 Do you identify with a particular race or ethnicity?
- 19 A. Yes. I identify as black/African American depending on if
- 20 you're talking about race or ethnicity.
- 21 | Q. Did you have any specific experiences growing up that you
- 22 | attribute to being African American?
- 23 A. Yes, quite a few. My entire upbringing was very much
- 24 | shaped by being African American: the foods that my family
- 25 ate, the music we listened to, the types of churches that we

- attended, the conversations that my parents had to have with me
 when -- around the mid-2010s when the filming of, like,
- 3 incidents of police brutality became very prevalent in media,
- 4 | talking -- conversations about my safety. There were also
- 5 several -- more than several, just constant personal incidents
- 6 | in our family that were very much shaped by race.
- 7 \mathbb{Q} . And what neighborhood did you grow up in?
- 8 A. For most of my upbringing, I lived in Wichita, Kansas, in a
- 9 neighborhood that was very close to Andover, which is a suburb.
- 10 | So it was a predominantly white neighborhood. We were one of
- 11 very few black families or families of color at all in that
- 12 neighborhood.
- 13 Q. And can you describe the interactions that your family had
- 14 | with their white neighbors?
- 15 A. Over the course of the years, we had several negative
- 16 interactions with our neighbors. For the most part, it was
- 17 | that we didn't interact in the same ways that other neighbors
- 18 were able to interact. The parties that people were invited
- 19 to, the backyard barbecues that everybody shared, they weren't
- 20 things that we were a part of.
- 21 There were also several incidents of just what seemed just
- 22 | like blatant racism. People in our neighborhood broke
- 23 | flowerpots on our front yard. They threw eggs at our house,
- 24 | things that would happen to us but wouldn't happen to other
- 25 neighbors around us.

- 1 Q. And how did those experiences tie to your racial identity?
- 2 How did they impact your world view prior to college?
- 3 A. They had a massive impact on my world view prior to
- 4 college. I think that as I was preparing to go to school, I
- 5 | very much had a -- a defensive mind-set. Like, these really
- 6 awful acts of racism were happening in not necessarily lethal
- 7 | ways toward my family but in lethal ways around the world; and
- 8 | I felt like I had an obligation to defend myself, to use
- 9 whatever gifts I had to defend or to uplift the rest of African
- 10 America, so to speak. I was afraid when I was preparing to go
- 11 to college.
- 12 Q. So you applied to UNC; is that correct?
- 13 $\|$ A. That is correct.
- 14 | Q. And what -- what aspects of UNC appealed to you when
- 15 deciding where to apply?
- 16 A. So at that time, I was really, really interested in
- 17 | political science. So my first step was getting further east
- 18 than Kansas, getting closer to DC where I thought the political
- 19 action would be throughout my college career. But I was also
- 20 | really interested in UNC's political science department. I
- 21 | thought that it was pretty good, especially for a state school.
- 22 | I also wanted to go to a school where it seemed like the
- 23 demographics would be a little bit more diverse than the high
- 24 school that I went to, which was not very diverse at all. So,
- 25 yeah, all those things were very important to me.

- Q. So what -- can you expand a little bit about why being at a college with other African Americans was of interest to you?
- 3 A. Sure. So, like I said, in high school, I didn't have very
- 4 many African American peers, and I just really thought that my
- 5 | learning experience and really my sense of self would be
- 6 enriched by being around more people who had perhaps
- 7 | experienced some of the joys and struggles of blackness that I
- 8 | had experienced.
- 9 Q. And when you applied, what was your understanding of
- 10 whether UNC considered race in its admissions policy?
- 11 A. When I applied, I -- yeah, as far as I knew, UNC did
- 12 consider race in its admissions policy. That was what I saw
- 13 when I looked through the application, so yeah.
- 14 | Q. And did that matter to you at all, that UNC considered race
- 15 | in its admissions?
- 16 A. I think that more than that mattering to me that they did,
- 17 | it would have mattered to me that they didn't. In my view from
- 18 | all of -- I applied to quite a few schools, and in my view, it
- 19 seemed like that was the norm. That's what every college did,
- 20 and that's what it meant to care about the race and ethnicity
- 21 | of the students coming in, to care about them as whole people.
- 22 | So it would have seemed really strange to me if UNC did not
- 23 consider race or ethnicity.
- 24 Q. Okay. So "strange to you," what does that mean?
- 25 \parallel A. It would have been off-putting in that I think I would have

- 1 | felt like they didn't care, and I would have assumed that there
- 2 was some sort of -- honestly, some sort of racist agenda behind
- 3 | it that would have made me unwelcome at the university.
- $4 \parallel Q$. Now, can you tell us a little bit about the high school you
- 5 were in? How did you perform academically in your high school?
- $6 \parallel A$. I performed well academically at my high school. I
- 7 graduated with a 3.93 GPA, and I was 13th out of 184 in my
- 8 class. I took a few AP classes, as many as felt appropriate.
- 9 | I avoided the sciences as much as I could. That was not my
- 10 | thing. But generally I performed well.
- 11 Q. And did you take the SAT?
- 12 A. Yes.
- 13 Q. How did you score on that?
- 14 A. I believe on the writing and reading sections, my scores
- 15 were over 700. My math section was around 660. I don't have
- 16 the exact numbers for that, but -- yeah.
- 17 | Q. Okay. And were you involved in extracurricular activities
- 18 | in high school?
- 19 A. Quite a few. Would you like me to name them?
- 20 Q. Name those where you took a leadership role.
- 21 | A. Sure. So I was the vice-captain of my cross-country team.
- 22 | I was the president of my thespian troupe in high school. I
- 23 was on the liaison board between the school district and the
- 24 high school students. I was a part of the -- president of the
- 25 | Bishop's youth council at -- in the jurisdiction for the

- 1 churches that I'm a part of. I was the president of the
- 2 | National Honors Society chapter at my school. I think those
- 3 | are all the most relevant ones.
- 4 | Q. And when you filled out your Common Application to UNC, did
- 5 | you list all of those academic -- I don't know -- academic
- 6 credentials in your application?
- $7 \parallel A$. Yes, that was a part of it.
- 8 Q. So also in the Common App that you filled out, the Common
- 9 | Application, did you decide to state your racial identity?
- 10 A. I did. I said that I was black.
- 11 | Q. There was a box in The Common Application that you were
- 12 able to check off?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 | Q. And was there any other -- any other way that you referred
- 15 | to your race in the Common Application?
- 16 \parallel A. Yes. In my Common Application essay, the main essay that I
- 17 sent off to all schools, my -- the main subject matter of that
- 18 essay was my race.
- 19 Q. Okay. Can you describe for us a little bit more about that
- 20 essay?
- 21 A. Sure. So that essay was about a decision that I made to
- 22 | move high schools from a private school to a public school in
- 23 order to -- to stand in solidarity with my brother, who had
- 24 experienced a whole lot of racism in some really detrimental
- 25 ways at the private school that we were at.

So I talked a lot about feeling like I was trying to fit into this Eurocentric world at this private school and going through this process of discovering my blackness as a high schooler, which very much continued to be a process when I was in college. But for me I think that essay spoke to how my world view had been shaped and the circumstances of my life had been shaped by my racial identity.

- 8 Q. And why did you choose to discuss your African American 9 identity in that Common Application essay?
 - A. Well, most of the schools that I applied to -- probably all the schools I applied to I talked about my goals of going into public policy, going into politics, and doing something to bring more racial justice to the United States. And the reason that I was passionate about that, the reason that I cared about it was because of my own racial experience, which gave me the empathy to care about the experiences of other minoritized races; but in my own experience, my passions were shaped by that identity; and it really would have made -- my story and my goals wouldn't have made a lot of sense without that information.
- 21 | Q. Why not?

10

11

12

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

- 22 | A. I think it gives -- it gives reason to why I care so much.
- 23 | I had -- because of the racism that I've experienced, because
- 24 of the wonderful, like, racial experiences that I've had, I
- 25 | have a -- I'm deeply invested. I have quite a stake in -- in

- the betterment of the lives of black people in America, and so the reason that I cared so much -- and in order to express, like, the passion that every college wants to hear about, they needed to know where this was coming from.
- Q. I'd like to ask you about racial diversity at UNC itself.

 What -- when you -- when you enrolled at UNC and in your

 first year and throughout the time that you were there, what

 interactions did you have with other students on UNC's campus

 who were different from you by race, by class, by other -
 other backgrounds?

- A. I can think of several groups that I was a part of that were really, really diverse in a lot of ways. My first year I was in one of the more diverse a cappella groups. Many of them are not. I was also a part of a student body president campaign that brought together a lot of different people from a lot of different backgrounds, but most poignantly, my undergrad experience was marked by my time in my campus ministry, aptly named Every Nation Campus. We had a lot of people of a lot of nationalities and a lot of different races, socioeconomic statuses coming together for the purpose of worship; and that very much that was probably one of the most formative and important groups that I was a part of at UNC.
- Q. And on a personal level, did you have any positive
 formative relationships that were created while you were there
 at UNC?

A. Certainly. My -- I'm smiling because my best friend is -
I met her when I was in a class called Ethics and Business in

Africa my first year, and we came to get close when we both

joined the same campus ministry on my -- in the middle of my

second year.

1.3

She is a white South African student, and being in a relationship with her over the years has healed a lot of wounds that I think — that I know that I've had because of the racism that I've experienced. I mean, we got to have some incredible conversations about — about race and justice, especially because of her family's involvement in apartheid in South Africa. That definitely complicated and enriched our discussion, and I don't think had her — had her ethnic and national and racial identity been different, and, likewise, mine, for those things, I don't think we would have been able to have those same enriching conversations and experiences that we've had over the years.

- Q. Now, while you were at UNC, were there other situations where you were with students of diverse backgrounds based upon events that happened off campus?
- A. Yes. Most -- what comes to mind is the police shooting of Keith Lamont Scott in Charlotte in 2016. That was the fall of my first year. As you all may know, a big percentage -- I couldn't give a number or anything, but a large amount of UNC student population is from Charlotte, so that shooting really

hit home. And protests that popped off at UNC's campus, there were students of -- really of many different backgrounds coming 2 3 together to march and to do sit-ins and die-ins all over the 4 campus. There were speeches being made. There was poetry 5 being shared in The Pit and at the Quad and all these different important spaces. But, yeah, the outside racial events in the 6 7 United States very much impacted my experience and the experiences of many black people at UNC. 8 9 Q. Now, while you were at UNC, how did that exposure to a 10 diverse student body impact your education? A. So as I mentioned before, I minored in creative writing, 11 but that really took up a lot of -- most of my -- a lot of my 12 1.3 academic time in my latter two years. So I was a -- I was -- I 14 focused in poetry composition, and those classes are typically 15 very small, 10 to 12 students. You write a lot of poems every week, and you critique them; you workshop them with each other. 16 17 Now, when I was in classes -- in poetry classes that had a lot of diversity in different ways -- I remember some classes 18 19 where we were diverse even in age, in race, in gender, and 20 sexuality. When I was in those classes with those different 21 makeups, I was able -- we were all able to get a lot better

feedback on our poems because we could hear how the art that we were creating impacted different people with different life experiences and different backgrounds. It was more likely that someone would be able to identify with the things that you were

22

23

talking about.

On the other hand, I had a few classes where I was the only black student, and there was a white professor and mostly white students. A lot of my poetry talks about my black experience, and in those classes, I was unable to get the feedback that I needed to become better at my craft because people -- like, on a very basic level, people didn't understand the things that I was talking about. So I wasn't able to get past the surface to become a better poet, and those were always really frustrating moments for me when nobody under -- it seemed like nobody understood me in those classes.

- Q. Now, did exposure to diversity on UNC's campus affect your leadership skills?
- A. Yes. I was in a program called the Robertson Scholars

 Leadership Program. So we did a lot of -- it was a selective

 group, and we did a lot of training on leadership. So in some

 of those trainings and dinners and workshops that we would

 have, we would sometimes have discussions that went awry.

 Somebody would say something racially insensitive or

 insensitive to -- something like that, and there would always

 be a discussion that was sparked about how we should address

 those types of issues.

In those moments, I had to learn how to work with people who -- who might really not be for me or for my well-being and continue to be in a relationship with them and continue to work

toward goals with them.

2

3

4

5

6

8

11

18

But also, outside of that, I was able to have conversations with the other black students and my cohorts about the things we could do to push the program to be more sensitive to minoritized groups; and I think that doing that background work, as well as listening to what people were saying in the room, really impacted my ability to lead diverse groups of people.

- Q. Based upon your experience at UNC, did ethnic and racial 9 diversity benefit other students besides yourself? 10
- A. I think so. I had a good friend who identified as Asian American/Indonesian American, and during my final few months at 12 1.3 UNC, we had a lot of conversations about what it -- how the black experience and the Asian experience interacted. And she 14 15 told me about how just knowing me and having other black friends helped open her eyes to experiences that she hadn't 16 17 considered before growing up in a predominantly white and Asian
- and in the ability to interact -- interact well with people who 19 20 were very different from her.

environment. She talked a lot about how she grew in compassion

- 21 Q. And what about other students' leadership skills? Were you 22 ever in any situations while you were on campus where you got 23 to see how ethnic and racial diversity helped other students' 24 leadership skills grow?
- Yes. Like I mentioned before, my first year I was a part

- of a student body president campaign with one student who -the candidate was a white male, and he pulled together students
 from a lot of different backgrounds for his campaign,
 especially first-years. He did a really good job of pulling
 together first-years.
- 6 When I think about the rooms where we had discussions about 7 campaign issues and about strategy and promotion videos and 8 things like that, they were always very, very diverse; and I 9 think that being able to have those different opinions in the 10 room helped this candidate to be able to reach out to students 11 of many different racial backgrounds, socioeconomic backgrounds, nationalities who were coming together to be a 12 part of his campaign and eventually to vote for him. 13
- Q. Ms. Watson, to what degree did you encounter diversity with any specific racial groups?
- 16 A. I'm sorry. Could you repeat that question?
- Q. Sure. So while you were at UNC, did you experience any situations where you encountered diversity within a given racial group?
- A. Yes. I understand. I did. I -- one of the most beautiful things about coming to college was that I got to be around more black people than I had ever been around before, which isn't saying much considering my upbringing, but it was significant for me. And in that, I was able to diversify my understanding of what it meant to be black. Growing up in a neighborhood and

in a school where I was always one of very few black people, I
had created this monolith of blackness that said that to be
black was to be like Hanna. It was to be like a Watson, which
was not true.

When I was at UNC, I interacted with black folks from
Sierra Leone, many Nigerian American friends, folks from
Australia, from Ghana, folks who grew up in North Carolina,
black folks who grew up in Colorado, people of different
socioeconomic statuses, of different sexualities, different
religious backgrounds. I had so many different experiences
interacting with black people and all of their diversity. I
was able to get a clearer view of -- I guess the idea that
blackness is not a monolith, that there are a lot of important
differences between black individuals.

- Q. Did that affect any stereotypes that you may have had?
- 16 A. I think so. If nothing else, it helped to break down
- 17 stereotypes I had harbored about people more recently connected
- 18 to their African heritage, meaning those who aren't the
- 19 descendants of slaves, yeah, and also just generally
- 20 stereotypes about what it means to be black; that it was not --
- 21 | it is not -- I could not equate that to what it meant to be
- 22 myself, what it meant to be a Watson in Kansas.
- 23 \mathbb{Q} . So you said that you interacted with black people from
- 24 different socioeconomic backgrounds; is that correct?
- 25 A. Correct.

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

- Q. So can you describe a little bit more about your interactions with African American students from other socioeconomic backgrounds than yourself?
- 4 A. Sure. When -- I think that interacting with black students 5 of other socioeconomic backgrounds made me aware of the 6 intersections of -- or the ways in which my own privilege 7 interacts with my own minoritization. Having come from a fairly affluent school and a fairly affluent family, I think 8 9 that it was helpful for me to be in classes, particularly my 10 African American studies classes, where we would discuss 11 experiences that people had that were very different from my own. I think it made me compassionate in a new way, helped me 12 1.3 to understand that -- that the struggles that I've experienced 14 through racism are not the only struggles that there are in the 15 world, but still that race and socioeconomic status interact in very important ways for people. 16
- Q. Now, while you were attending UNC, what was your view regarding whether there was adequate representation of students of color on campus?
- A. For the most part, actually completely, I never thought
 that there was adequate representation. Even when choosing to
 come to UNC, I was aware that UNC's black population was not
 reflective of North Carolina's black population, and I studied
 that a little bit in a class my first year -- a service
 learning course my first year.

But I just -- I remember feeling very much like if there were more black people at UNC, then there might be an even 2 3 greater -- there might be an even greater view of the diversity 4 of blackness that would make more room for me. There were many 5 moments that I felt like I was not black enough because I didn't fit this monolith that many white students and just 6 7 other students were telling me about what it meant to be black. 8 I think that -- excuse me. I was -- throughout my 9 education, I was dissatisfied with the number of black people, 10 people of color at UNC. 11 Q. Did that play out in any of the extracurricular activities 12 that you participated in on campus, that lack of representation? 13 A. I remember having strange or uncomfortable social 14 15 interactions related to my a cappella group when I was at UNC. A cappella is a whole wild world at UNC that is full of racism 16 17 and division, and I just remember being seen as kind of the token black girl who was the one black person who wasn't in the 18 black a cappella group, and there just wasn't -- it didn't seem 19 20 like there was space for -- because of the inadequate number of 21 people of color in that sect of -- in that sect of UNC, there 22 wasn't space for any difference. People didn't accept that, 23 and they got very uncomfortable with it. 24 Now, how did the lack of representation make you feel in the classroom?

A. In the classroom the lack of representation was burdensome.

I remember specifically my POLI 101 class or POLI 100 class at

UNC. There were maybe 2- or 300 people in the lecture hall,

and definitely fewer than 15 black people in the room.

2.2

When we would have discussions about America's racial and political history, just stereotypically all heads would turn toward the black people in the room; and in that I felt so much pressure to say the right thing because it seemed there was an expectation that I would be the representative for the race, that I would -- that I would be able to speak for every single black person in America, and that -- I think that pressure was undue and probably would have been relieved had there been a greater number of black people in the room.

- Q. How did that experience, being in a majority white classroom, affect your participation in the class?
- A. It depended on the day, but often my participation was marked more by my -- by my knowledge of being a minority in the room than it was by whether or not I actually had something to say. There were moments when I felt like I had to speak up because nobody else was speaking up for black people, even though I didn't know what to say. There were moments when I felt uncomfortable speaking about my own experience because of something else that a white student had said in the classroom.
- Q. Were there times when some students -- or when you heard any sort of racially offensive statements while you were in

class?

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- A. I don't remember any specific incidents, but I -- I don't remember any specific words, but I do remember one particular student in that POLI 100 class who would often say things that made several black students uncomfortable, and that was over the course of the entire semester.
- 7 \mathbb{Q} . So how did you react to that, or did you?
- A. In that early semester -- that was my first year -- I 8 9 didn't really have much of an outlet to be able to share the 10 difficulty of those experiences. I didn't yet have a super 11 diverse friend group, so I didn't -- I internalized it a lot, and that was, of course, a very difficult time to do that. As 12 1.3 I spoke earlier about the Keith Lamont Scott shooting and all 14 the protests going on, it was a very tumultuous time to be 15 black at UNC from the classroom to the -- to the police brutality that was going on across the country. 16
 - Q. Well, what at UNC helped ease your sense of isolation?
 - A. I think when I finally found my fit in this super diverse campus ministry, when I was able to make friends from many different backgrounds, and especially to make friends who were black and different than me and also similar to me in some ways, I felt like I had a place, a people that I could share my experiences with. And before I had that, it was -- life was a lot more difficult. It was a lot more difficult to be a student at UNC.

- Q. Did -- your finding those safe spaces, did that impact in any way your participation in the majority white classes?
- 3 A. I think so. I think that having those safe spaces, being
- 4 able to have conversations about what I was experiencing in
- 5 class just made me more confident as a person. I became more
- 6 settled in being able to say what was on my mind, to be able to
- 7 share what I thought was important to the course discussion
- 8 | regardless of who else was in the room. So my academic
- 9 experience was very much shaped by my social experience at UNC.
- 10 Q. Now, are you aware of UNC's history of racism and
- 11 | exclusion?
- 12 | A. Yes.
- 13 Q. While you were at UNC, did you come into contact with any
- 14 monuments or symbols of that racist legacy?
- 15 A. Yes. The Silent Sam statue, I don't know how familiar you
- 16 all are with that. That -- the Silent Sam statue, this
- 17 Confederate monument of an unknown Confederate soldier, marked
- 18 my UNC experience. I mean, from the time that I got there --
- 19 | it was like as soon as I arrived, there were protests around
- 20 the statue trying to get it to be torn down. While I was
- 21 | there, there were moments when white supremacists came to the
- 22 | campus wielding guns to defend the statue. When I was an
- 23 upperclassman, somebody -- a student pulled down the statue,
- 24 | and then there was a whole debacle about where the statue was
- 25 going to go and all the anger in the student body about

- millions of dollars being given to continue to preserve it in a museum. So, yeah, this racist legacy is -- it pervaded my UNC
- 3 experience.
- 4 Q. Were you aware of the controversy over the building names
- 5 | themselves?
- 6 A. To some extent. I wasn't deeply involved in them, but I was aware.
- Q. And so what was your understanding about the names on some
 of the buildings on UNC's campus?
- 10 A. Well, I knew that some of the names were -- some of the
- 11 | buildings were named after figures who had intentionally
- 12 perpetuated racism at UNC enough so that students felt very
- 13 uncomfortable with learning in classrooms that were named after
- 14 them. So I knew that there were efforts to get some of them
- 15 changed. Like, what is currently Carolina Hall I believe used
- 16 to be Saunders Hall, and that was a big issue while I was at
- 17 UNC. They tried to get it renamed to Hurston Hall after Zora
- 18 Neale Hurston. Yeah, that's kind of the extent of my knowledge
- 19 \parallel of that.
- 20 Q. All right. And, Ms. Watson, so have you seen any progress
- 21 by UNC from its history of racism to now with its official
- 22 policy of inclusion and diversity?
- 23 A. I have seen progress, and I do have a lot of hope for UNC.
- 24 | I think that -- when I think about my own personal experience,
- 25 | I think that the honors college that I was a part of did a

pretty good job of trying to listen to the experiences of black students and ask specific questions about how they could serve 2 3 and help students to flourish at the university during times of 4 really acute racial unrest, and I compare that experience to 5 the histories that I had studied in several classes, going to 6 archives at UNC and at Duke to study the different -- the different incidents of racism at UNC and how students had 7 responded to them in the past. Comparing that to what was 8 9 happening in my own life, it showed that UNC was not perfect, 10 but there had been efforts to progress forward, and I 11 appreciated that. 12 Q. Based upon your personal experience, how would a reduction 1.3 in the number of students of color on UNC's campus affect its 14 racial climate? 15 I think that that would -- I think it would be devastating. When I think about the -- the moments when there were white 16 17 supremacists wielding guns around my campus and I was being 18 told by my loved ones, like, "Stay in your dorm no matter what. 19 Do not leave. This is not the time to fight this or to 20 protest," I thought about why in the world they even felt 21 comfortable coming to this space. 2.2 And, you know, in order for somebody to feel comfortable 23 with those views, openly showing them in that way, in a violent 24 way, I think it says something about the environment of UNC. What I mean to say is that if there were fewer black people, I

- 1 would expect that even more incidents like that would happen
- 2 | because people who were not for black people, people who
- 3 believed in white supremacy, people who were racist would feel
- 4 | even more comfortable, would feel like they have even more of a
- 5 | foothold on UNC's campus and continue to terrorize the students
- 6 there.
- 7 \mathbb{Q} . What message to students of color might it send if UNC
- 8 ended its use of race in its admissions practice?
- 9 A. I think it would show that UNC didn't care about the racial
- 10 experiences that students had and have and that, like me, have
- 11 shaped many, many students. It -- yeah, it would show a lack
- 12 of care. It would show a lack of awareness of the very real
- 13 | impacts of race in America and globally if they didn't ask
- 14 | those sorts of questions.
- 15 Q. Now, since you've graduated from UNC, what further academic
- 16 | studies have you started?
- 17 | A. Yes. I am in my first semester at Princeton Theological
- 18 | Seminary, and I'm pursuing a master's in divinity.
- 19 Q. And how -- if at all, how has UNC's experience -- the
- 20 | experience that you had while you were a student at UNC
- 21 | interacting with diverse groups of students, how has that
- 22 | affected your postcollege work and life?
- 23 A. So Princeton is very intentional about -- about doing
- 24 | antiracism work. They've recently done an historical audit on
- 25 | their slavery -- on their hand in slavery, so we've had a lot

of discussions about racism and how to be agents of antiracism at the seminary. And I think my experiences at UNC have enriched that discussion, to be able to share with people what it looks like to be at a university or at an institution where there isn't this sort of intentional antiracism work going on in the same way.

1.3

I also think that the relationships that I formed and the friendships that I made at UNC have helped me socially at Princeton to interact with a number of different people. I don't think that I would have — be able to have a healthy relationship with my current roommate, who is white, if I hadn't had those interactions with my best friend who was white that broke down a lot of the stereotypes and the — and the trauma that I had from other interactions with white people as a high schooler and before that.

- Q. Just one last question, Ms. Watson. Why did you choose to participate in this case?
 - A. So I was asked by one of my -- somebody who was in -- my scholarship cohort to consider participating, and I wanted to -- I thought that my experience would be a way to give a face to some of the numbers that people are talking about.

 This -- whether or not -- like, using race in admissions is -- it's not just about numbers. It's about real people with real experiences, and I thought that this would be an opportunity to

do justice just by telling my story, just a small way that I

```
could be a part of antiracism efforts.
       Okay. Thank you.
 2
 3
            MR. HOLTZMAN: We have no further questions.
 4
             THE COURT: All right. Questions?
 5
            MR. HASSAN: No further questions, Your Honor.
6
            MS. HENDERSON: No questions.
 7
             THE COURT: All right. Thank you.
8
        Thank you so very much. You are released at this time.
9
             THE WITNESS: Thank you.
10
             THE COURT: Uh-huh.
       All right. Let's call your next witness.
11
12
            MS. TORRES: Your Honor, our next should be on the
   video as well, and then we do have a live witness as well. So
13
    I'm guessing that he's logged on, Luis Acosta, and David
14
15
   Hinojosa will be directing him.
        (The witness appeared on the video screen.)
16
17
             THE COURT: If we could have the witness sworn,
18
   please.
19
          LUIS ACOSTA, INTERVENORS' WITNESS VIA VIDEO, SWORN
                          DIRECT EXAMINATION
20
   BY MR. HINOJOSA:
21
22
             THE COURT: You may put your hand down, sir. Thank
23
   you.
24
       Yes, sir.
            MR. HINOJOSA: All right. Thank you. Dave Hinojosa
```

- for Student-Intervenors, Your Honor.
- 2 THE COURT: Yes. You may proceed.
- 3 MR HINOJOSA: Sorry. I was having technical
- 4 difficulties in shutting off my own phone there.
- 5 | Q. (By Mr. Hinojosa) Can you please state and spell your
- 6 | name?
- $7 \parallel A$. Luis Acosta. L-u-i-s is the first name. Acosta is
- 8 | A-c-o-s-t-a.
- 9 Q. And you're an Intervenor in this case, correct?
- 10 | A. Yes, sir, I am.
- 11 | Q. And how do you identify yourself ethnically?
- 12 A. I identify myself as a Mexican American.
- 13 Q. And where did you go to undergraduate school?
- 14 A. I went to UNC-Chapel Hill.
- 15 Q. And what year did you graduate with your bachelor's degree?
- 16 $\|$ A. I graduated in 2017 with a degree in chemistry.
- 17 Q. All right. Are you presently in school?
- 18 A. Yes. I'm a second-year medical student at UNC-Chapel Hill.
- 19 Q. All right. I wanted to first ask you some questions about
- 20 your childhood, Mr. Acosta.
- 21 Where did you grow up?
- 22 A. So I grew up in Hendersonville, North Carolina, which is in
- 23 western North Carolina, about 30 -- 30 minutes south of
- 24 | Asheville.
- 25 | Q. And how long did you live in Hendersonville?

- 1 \parallel A. I lived there my whole life, so I guess -- I'm 25 now, but
- 2 | before I started college I was 17, so 17 years.
- $3 \parallel Q$. And who did you grow up with in your family?
- $4 \parallel A$. I grew up with my mom, my dad, and three younger brothers.
- $5 \parallel Q$. And what education level did your parents attain?
- 6 | A. So my mom did finish middle school, and my dad finished
- 7 | middle school, but he didn't finish high school. And this was
- 8 both in Mexico.
- 9 $\|$ Q. All right. And what do your parents do for a living?
- 10 A. So my mom is a homemaker, and my dad works for a factory.
- 11 Q. And when you went to school, did you qualify for a free
- 12 | lunch?
- 13 A. Yes, yes, I did. Elementary school we got free lunches and
- 14 | breakfast.
- 15 | Q. And were you the first in your family to attend college?
- 16 | A. Yes, I was.
- 17 $\|Q$. Were you the last to attend?
- 18 A. No. I have three younger brothers that -- oh. Sorry,
- 19 | not -- the youngest is still in high school, but the next
- 20 youngest brother went on to go to Appalachian State. He
- 21 graduated there, and he's in school now to do something else
- 22 with the medical field for paramedic. And then the next
- 23 youngest brother is a freshman here at UNC.
- 24 Q. All right. And your youngest brother, you said he's in
- 25 | high school?

- A. Yes, the youngest brother is in high school, and he's a junior. So he's still got some time, but I think college is definitely on his radar, so...
 - Q. Did your own college path help influence your brothers?

11

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

25

- A. I feel like it did. You know, I don't know if they'd admit to it, but I think it allowed them to see, like, it's possible given what we had and there's more out there. And, you know, when they came to visit me those times here at UNC, I think it really left a number on them and they'll want -- I think college is something they want to be a part of and knowing that
- 12 Q. What do your parents think of having had three out of the 13 four sons, at least thus far, attend college?

they have the opportunity to do it. So I think it did.

- A. Well, they're very proud of us. I think, you know, the whole education thing, they weren't really familiar with it. I don't think they realized, you know, how competitive schools are, how like -- you know, just how the environment is and, like, for us all -- for the first three to do it and fourth about to do it, I think it really, you know, made them proud of what we were able to do with what we were given and have the opportunity to do what they didn't have an opportunity to do in Mexico.
- Q. I want to first talk about your life growing up -- or I next want to talk about your life growing up in Hendersonville.

 Can you provide the Court with a general overview of what

the Hendersonville community was like growing up?

- 2 A. Growing up, I would describe it as, like, a very tight-knit
- 3 community, very small, a lot of -- I think the generic, like,
- 4 composure of the town was, you know, primarily like people from
- 5 | farm -- farming backgrounds and primarily white if they weren't
- 6 | farming, and there were Latinos and other groups spread around
- 7 | there. So definitely the majority was white.
- 8 | Q. And did you ever personally observe or experience
- 9 discrimination in the community based on your ethnicity?
- 10 A. Yes, I did. It was countless times that, you know, as a
- 11 | kid it would make you wonder, you know, why am I going through
- 12 | this and that. I don't know. It did leave a number on me as a
- 13 kid, and now I do a little reflecting back on it.
- But I think one key thing I remember in the community -- I
- 15 was pretty young at the time, but we were driving, me and my
- 16 mom, down to -- like beside the main street, and my mom was
- 17 going the speed limit, and there's this anxious driver behind
- 18 us. He was driving a truck. He was an older white male; and
- 19 he reversed around, sped up, slowed down to be beside our car,
- 20 and spit at the windshield where I was at, and told us, "Go
- 21 back to Mexico, you spics, " and just sped off.
- 22 And I don't know, like, as a kid, it just makes you wonder,
- 23 | like, why -- like, this is -- the way I am is a bad thing. So,
- 24 | I don't know, there's that and countless other stories, but I
- 25 think that's like a big one that comes to my mind right now.

- 1 \mathbb{Q} . Now, you attended school in Hendersonville; is that right?
- $2 \parallel A$. Yes, yes, I did.
- 3 \parallel Q. And what schools did you attend there in Hendersonville?
- 4 A. So I went to three: elementary school, middle school, and
- 5 | high school, so -- yeah.
- 6 \parallel Q. And what was the name of the high school you went to?
- 7 A. East Henderson High School.
- 8 | Q. Now, did you ever experience discrimination or observe
- 9 discrimination because of your ethnicity in the schools?
- 10 A. Yes, unfortunately, I did, I think at every level. I had
- 11 one encounter with that in elementary school. Like, I recall
- 12 we were banned from speaking Spanish for the remainder of a
- 13 year. It was like an informal ban, but, you know, all the
- 14 | kids -- we were -- I don't know. Maybe we were troublesome.
- 15 I'm not sure. But every time we'd get in trouble and, you
- 16 know, we'd -- we would, like, hang out after class -- or not
- 17 | after class -- sorry -- during lunch and speaking Spanish. But
- 18 teachers thought we were speaking bad about them, and they said
- 19 we couldn't speak Spanish anymore because they couldn't
- 20 understand what we were saying. So that was a little odd.
- 21 was pretty young at the time.
- 22 And then I remember another story, middle school, where I
- 23 | had a classmate who was white and another friend -- another
- 24 classmate who was Mexican, and we were all sitting at the lunch
- 25 | table, and my Mexican friend brought the little jalapeños in a

1.3

cup -- not a cup -- sorry -- in a can you can buy at the store, the jalapeños and carrots and all of those things. He had one of the carrots there, and my white friend wanted to play a prank on his sister. So he grabbed the carrot, put it on his sister's plate and swapped it out for the carrot she had on her plate. Then she ate it, got, like, really -- like, that was super, super hot and then started rubbing her eyes and then, you know, she had to go to the eyewash station. And after that, like, you know, they got in trouble, but my Mexican friend got suspended, but my white friend who did it didn't.

And then from that point, though, like, all the Hispanics from that grade level, we were all put in a classroom by ourselves, and it was sort of like -- I don't know, like, what the intention was there, but it was like a threat. But that's what happened after that incident, and we got a good talking to about that.

And then the last thing was probably in high school was, like -- you know, obviously, I had some issues going into -- like, going to high school to begin with, like, with the advisors and not wanting me to go into certain classes.

But I think the bigger thing was, like, when I was, like, playing basketball the first year, just receiving, like, all sorts of negative comments from the upperclassmen. At the beginning they thought I was Asian. They would call me chink and ching chong and all these different things and, like, would

- 1 just chunk the ball at me at practice and kind of be, like,
- 2 | physically abusive, too, in the locker room, like push and
- 3 | shove me and call me names. And they found out I was Mexican,
- 4 and they just changed their wording from chink and ching chong
- 5 to spic and wetback and beaner.
- 6 I don't know. It was tough, but, like, you know, I would
- 7 | just be nice and hope for the best. But, yeah, I mean, it
- 8 sucked looking back on it, but that's how it was.
- 9 | Q. Now, do you feel whether your race is seen differently than
- 10 | your socioeconomic status?
- 11 A. I feel like there's -- like, from all those times I've
- 12 been, like, you know, discriminated against, you know, the
- 13 | first thing they said or the first thing that came to their
- 14 | mind was about my color and who I was, right. Very rarely did
- 15 | I get anything about the economic status, like, just because
- 16 people could hide that, I feel like, but being a minority group
- 17 you can't really hide. So, yeah.
- 18 Q. And did you take a -- what type of coursework did you take
- 19 at East Hendersonville High School?
- 20 | A. I feel like I took all the, you know, rigorous courses I
- 21 could take there, mainly consisting of honors and AP classes.
- 22 | I just tried to challenge myself as much as I could when I was
- 23 there.
- 24 | Q. Did you ever have any problems getting into any certain
- 25 classes at East Hendersonville High School?

3

5

6

8

9

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

Yes, I did, mainly at the beginning when I was going from an eighth grader into a ninth grader. You know, I don't think the counselor -- that counselor at the time didn't know what type of student I was, had her doubts and -- you know, I placed out of Algebra I. I was in the advanced math classes, and I was trying to take Algebra II or geometry, but she didn't let me. She was trying to tell me I wasn't ready for it and I had to take Algebra I again; I couldn't handle the rigor and all these other things. But, like, I was also the only Hispanic in 10 that eighth-grade cohort, and she was the only one that told me those comments. And, you know, thankfully she's not there no 12 more.

But it was just odd to me that, like, you know, in talking to my friends, like, "Are you all getting these comments from her? Is she telling you not to take it like I can't take it?" And they all would say no. So it was a little odd.

And then too, like, you know, there's an AP course, AP World, which is, like, the class that all the ninth grade high-achieving students are supposed to take to, you know, stay competitive, but they didn't let me into that one either. just said I couldn't handle it, I wasn't ready to handle it yet, but -- yeah.

- 23 Q. And do you recall whether there were any persons of color 24 in that world history AP course?
- No, there wasn't any in that one. Yeah, no. Actually, no,

- l | there wasn't.
- $2 \parallel Q$. And in the other advanced and AP courses that you took at
- 3 | East Hendersonville High, were --
- 4 A. So all the other, you know, AP maths and bios and language
- 5 | arts, like, there is very -- there was not any -- I was usually
- 6 \parallel the only one in my -- one of my really good friends from UNC
- 7 also was the other one for, like, the language arts courses.
- 8 \parallel So it was like I was the math/science person. He was the
- 9 | language arts person. But, yeah, we were it, just me and him.
- 10 | Q. And in high school what extracurricular activities did you
- 11 | engage in?
- 12 A. So I played basketball until my junior year. I played
- 13 tennis for the majority of it. I did a lot of extracurriculars
- 14 with other student groups at the school that did
- 15 service-oriented things, and I think the most -- most of my
- 16 amount of time was spent at the Boys & Girls Club toward the
- 17 | end, so volunteering there.
- 18 Q. And approximately how many hours did you volunteer?
- 19 A. Oh, man. Well, I definitely -- at least 300, upwards of
- 20 | that area. I didn't want -- I spent a good majority of my time
- 21 | there just because I enjoyed it so much. So I think it was
- 22 | over 300.
- 23 Q. Some of your academic qualifications are listed in Exhibit
- 24 | DI30 that's been entered or will be entered into this -- I
- 25 think into the record in this case. But, generally speaking,

- 1 how do you feel you did academically in your coursework in high 2 school?
- 3 A. I feel like I did solid. I feel like I did, you know, as 4 well as I could have. I finished sixth out of
- $5 \parallel 200\text{-and-something kids at the end of the day, and that -- I did$
- 6 | well. I got As and Bs in every single one of my courses and
- 7 did challenge myself as much as I could there, so I think I did
- 8 good.
- 9 Q. And I don't want you to disclose your specific SAT and ACT
- 10 and AP scores here. They are identified in Exhibit DI30. But
- 11 how do you feel you did on those standardized tests?
- 12 A. Knowing -- like, I didn't know the resources I had and, you
- 13 know, that you actually had to study for it -- again, I didn't
- 14 know what went down in the whole college thing, but I feel like
- 15 | I didn't do my best, but I feel like I did what I could with
- 16 the resources I had. You know, I -- I think I would hear kids
- 17 | getting tutoring and buying all these books for it, and it just
- 18 | never, you know, occurred to me or it was something I thought I
- 19 should have done. Even if I could have done, I probably would
- 20 have felt guilty asking my parents for the money just because,
- 21 | like, you know, I was the first one to go, but there were three
- 22 | younger ones they've got to worry about. So, yeah, I don't
- 23 think I did the best I could have, but, you know, I did what I
- 24 | could at the time.
- 25 Q. So just to be clear, you didn't know that you could

- participate in tutoring or that there were certain workbooks 2 that could possibly help you, you know, study and improve your 3 scores?
- 4 A. Uh-huh. I had no idea, none at all, just like -- I just 5 heard people just taking it, and I was like, "I guess I've got to take this to get in." That's it. I didn't really study at 6 all. No, I didn't study at all.
- Q. Do you feel your college entrance exams reflect your 8 ability to succeed in college?

11

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

A. I don't think they did. I'll be honest, the first semester was tough for me, but, you know, after that -- like, it was all uphill. I didn't let that hold me back. At the beginning, you 12 know, you hear the students bragging about the SAT, ACT and just feel like reflecting on that the first semester in college.

But, like, I mean, after that little phase runs out, it's really just -- college is a whole different ballgame. You're by yourself, and it's where, you know, your work ethic comes out. You know, if you're motivated, you get through it and everything. I feel like it's just one of those things that's meant for college admissions and is a factor, one of many, you know.

- 23 Q. Sure. And when did you first become interested in applying to UNC? 24
- So I first became interested in applying to UNC, like

- 1 actually, actually applying, the summer going into my senior
- 2 | year. I met a mentor of mine through the Boys & Girls Club.
- 3 She was at Duke University. You know, I was telling her what I
- 4 wanted to do with my life. She gave me kind of like an
- 5 overview of where I could apply, and UNC was one of those. You
- 6 know, I had only seen them, like, playing basketball, and you
- 7 \parallel know, they had a good reputation as, like, the state college.
- 8 You know, everybody wants to be a Tar Heel. So I just didn't
- 9 put two and two together and actually apply until that summer
- 10 | because I had her guidance at that point.
- 11 | Q. And what was the race or ethnicity of your mentor from
- 12 Duke?
- 13 A. So she was Mexican American.
- 14 | Q. And who filled out your application?
- 15 A. So that was all me. You know, everything was on me.
- 16 Q. And how was that experience for you and how old were you?
- 17 | A. It was very difficult. Like, definitely a lot of stress
- 18 and, you know, having to do that with school at the time,
- 19 preparing for exams, just feeling alone with all of it. You
- 20 know, I recall talking to my buddy, the one who came here and
- 21 was also, you know, I would say, like, the other minority with
- 22 | me that was high performing, you know. We were complaining
- 23 about it, saying we want to give up, like maybe we shouldn't go
- 24 to college. But, you know, having him around, we talked each
- 25 other into finishing it out, but it was very difficult. Just a

- lot of questions, a lot for a 16-, 17-year-old kid that didn't know what to put and didn't want to put the wrong thing, you know.
- 4 Q. Were your families able to assist you with filling out the application?
- A. No, they were not. You know, I just asked them to give me the documents, and I would take the rest from there. But, you know, I did try to get them, but they just didn't understand much of what was going on. English isn't their first language, so I just really had to research and do it all on my own.
- 11 Q. Now, when you applied, you requested a fee waiver for the application fee at UNC; is that correct?

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2.

A. Uh-huh, yeah. So that was brought -- I got a fee waiver for that and the SAT and I think something else. But, gosh, my junior and senior year advisor, very nice lady. She helped me out so much with that. So I was very thankful for her assistance with all of that.

MR HINOJOSA: And, Your Honor, at this moment we're going to show the college application. If we could take off the feed. We're not going to want the portion of the transcript sealed, but we will -- want to ensure we don't show the application.

THE COURT: All right. Understood.

(Audio privacy settings were turned on.)

(Sealed portion of trial testimony occurred next and

```
appears under separate cover filed with the court.)
 2
        (Audio privacy settings were turned off.)
 3
             THE CLERK: Okay. They're ready to go, Judge.
 4
             THE COURT: All right. You may proceed.
 5
            MR HINOJOSA: Sorry about that.
6
        (By Mr. Hinojosa) But I had just asked you about whether
 7
   you had taken any classes where there was a greater level of
   diversity in the class.
9
   A. Okay. So greater level of diversity was in my sociology
10
    courses. It was a little different for, like, a pre-med kid to
   be taking that, but I think for me, I wanted to get, like, the
11
12
   full picture.
1.3
        So this class I was in is about society and health, and it
   was interesting because, like, you know, we have people from
14
15
   all different backgrounds. There was a stat about black
    females of each income level -- so lower, middle, and upper --
16
17
   and they were comparing miscarriage rates and premature births
   to white women and Latino women and Asian women and the
18
   American. So they had it all. Like, the minorities were the
19
20
   ones that had the lower right, and the black females at every
21
    level was worse than a white female at the lower income -- the
2.2
   lowest income level.
23
        I don't know. I think that that definitely did a number on
   me, like, reflecting on that, like, why is that. I remember
24
  people were getting in discussions about, like -- you know, no,
```

- like, racism is the most ordinary -- like, socioeconomic -- all
- 2 these other things, but it's hard to -- the battle of the
- 3 stats. And, like, even now as a medical student, there are so
- 4 many things like that where race really does impact health
- 5 | outcomes; and, you know, like I said, it's sort of like a
- 6 growing thing. We're just not sure in what way.
- 7 But it was definitely, like, having that space back then,
- 8 | reflecting on that, and then, like, remembering those details
- 9 now, you know, it's, like, allowed me to get a full scope of
- 10 | everything.
- 11 Q. Were the different perspectives that you were talking about
- 12 offered by people of different races?
- 13 A. Yes.
- 14 \parallel Q. And did that help you think about things differently also
- 15 | in that moment?
- 16 A. It did. It did, and especially under the guidance of that
- 17 | instructor. You know, she was very amazing with what she does
- 18 | and her research, and the way she taught the class helped a
- 19 lot, all of it.
- 20 | Q. All right. Now, outside of the classroom, did you have
- 21 | opportunities to meet new friends and build relationships with
- 22 people across races and ethnicities?
- 23 A. Yes. You know, I think outside the classroom there wasn't
- 24 | a whole lot of us, but, you know, the few that we did have,
- 25 | like, you know, we were -- we knew of each other. We would

- walk around and give each other head nods, and, like, you know,
 we'd always, like, greet each other. That's just the way the
 minorities were. We were close-knit, I believe, and I think it
- 4 was cool that I could -- you know, I felt, like, nice knowing
- 5 that I had those few around there.
- 6 Q. And did you have the opportunity to meet people that you
- 7 | had never met before of different races and culture?
- 8 A. Yeah. You know, I had never met African people before. I
- 9 | had never met, you know, a lot of Indian people before,
- 10 different Asians. Like, you know, I really got everything at
- 11 UNC and really broke down a lot of things I had coming in about
- 12 some people and helped me build, like, you know -- be a really
- 13 overall diverse person with that, you know.
- 14 Q. Now I want to talk a little bit about diversity within
- 15 diversity.
- Did you personally have any stereotypes about more affluent
- 17 | Latinx students or more affluent white students?
- 18 A. Yeah. So, I mean, I kind of came in thinking the rich kids
- 19 were stuck up, but now, like, once I got to meet people, it was
- 20 | like, you know, it all just boils down to how people are
- 21 | raised.
- 22 | Like giving you an example, you know, I had an upper-income
- 23 student who was white and, you know, probably -- one of my best
- 24 | friends now. But, you know, I convinced him to join this group
- 25 | I was in and, you know, the way he connected -- so the group

was geared towards, like, mentoring at-risk Latino middle school students; and, you know, he was able to kind of change some perspectives he had about, you know, undocumented students and -- because he was born on the conservative side of things and, like, here he really had a space to, like, understand how these other kids are living their lives. You know, we took some trips to their neighborhoods, and he met with the family and, like, kind of got a good rapport with them, and -- you know, just because some students aren't as fortunate. I think that really changed the way he thought about things.

1.3

There were two Latino first-year students I recruited. I didn't know, like, their parents were pretty high-end, like
CEOs of certain things; and, like, those Latinos I feel like
were really cool in that they were really there to help out the
program and kind of kept out their whole -- you know, all the
riches they had. Like, they just -- I don't know. They did
good in not, like, bragging about it and making people feel
uncomfortable about the things they had and, like, what these
kids didn't have like I had seen in the past. I don't know. I
really thought it was cool just, you know, having that
diversity within diversity, just breaking down the barriers and
biases I had.

- Q. Did it also break biases down they had about people like you?
 - 5 A. Yeah, yeah, I think it did. Like I said, those Latino

- 1 | kids, like -- just everyone is different, you know. Everyone
- 2 has got their own story and roles and stuff. Low income,
- 3 | middle income, high income, like, as long as they have the
- 4 common goal, I think everything can work out.
- $5 \parallel Q$. Now, at the medical school have you belonged to any
- 6 organizations or associations?
- 7 A. So I was a copresident for the Latino Medical Student
- 8 Association, and I was also in the student government. I was a
- 9 VP for diversity and campus affairs. So those are my two big
- 10 things. I did some other things here and there, but those are
- 11 | the big things.
- 12 \parallel Q. You testified here today about some of the benefits of
- 13 diversity that you've experienced at UNC.
- 14 What sort of impact do you believe this will have on you
- 15 professionally when you graduate?
- 16 \parallel A. I think for me, it's going to allow me to be just like a --
- 17 | just like a doctor that can critically think about certain
- 18 issues and just keep everything in context because, like, you
- 19 know, obviously -- you said professionally, right? Describe
- 20 how it was going to help me professionally?
- 21 Q. Yes.
- 22 A. Okay. You know, like, as a kid, my mom -- we were on WIC
- 23 and like, you know, having -- knowing what resources we had
- 24 back then and, like, being able to see, like, you know, what
- 25 ways we can improve low-income families, those resources,

having those experiences.

1.3

But then also, like, hearing the different things about, you know, these stats on what populations are more at risk will allow me to put a little bit more focus and not miss certain key things when I'm building, you know, my differential or, like, one — have a treatment plan and assessment with my patients in the future. So I really do think having all those experiences are going to help out in the long run.

And also, even when it comes to food, right, all these different students I have interacted with, like, had different cuisines and just being familiar with, like, what they eat and being able to fit that can help out in the long run.

- Q. Why is it important that state flagships like UNC remain visibly open to underrepresented students of color like yourself?
- A. I think it's helpful because, like, UNC is so big and, like, I feel like they've got a lot of resources for this. And I remember, like, even applying to schools like there was a couple schools I stayed away from just because of their reputation and, like, not having as many Latinos around. I think UNC has got a cool thing in that, you know, they have a good opportunity to really retain the best of the best by remaining visibly open so they could really improve the state with the overall everything, you know.
- Q. All right. Thank you, Mr. Acosta.

1	MR. HINOJOSA: No further questions.
2	THE COURT: Yes.
3	MR. HASSAN: No questions, Your Honor.
4	MS. HENDERSON: No questions.
5	THE COURT: All right. Thank you, sir. You are
6	released at this time. We appreciate you being here.
7	THE WITNESS: All right. You all have a good one.
8	Appreciate it.
9	THE COURT: All right. Let us take our morning
10	recess, and we will resume at 11:35.
11	(A morning recess was taken from 11:20 until 11:35 a.m.;
12	all parties present.)
13	THE COURT: Call your next witness, please.
14	MS. TURNER: Emily Turner, Your Honor.
15	Defendant Intervenors call Rimel Mwamba.
16	THE COURT: Thank you.
17	RIMEL MWAMBA, INTERVENORS' WITNESS, SWORN
18	DIRECT EXAMINATION
19	BY MS. TURNER:
20	THE COURT: You may remove your mask if you're more
21	comfortable that way.
22	THE WITNESS: Thank you, Your Honor.
23	Q. Good morning, Ms. Mwamba. Could you state your name for
24	the record, please?
25	A. Yes. My name is Rimel Gason Mwamba.

- Q. Can you describe your educational background?
- 2 A. Yes. For high school, I went to Spring Valley High School
- 3 | in Columbia, South Carolina, where I attended the Discovery
- 4 | Magnet Program for math and science; and then for university, I
- 5 | attended the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill with a
- 6 dual enrollment at Duke University through the Robertson
- 7 | Scholarship.
- 8 | Q. For the record, when did you graduate from the University
- 9 of North Carolina?
- 10 A. I graduated in 2018.
- 11 Q. And what did you study there?
- 12 A. I studied global health with -- global studies with a focus
- 13 | in global health with minors in chemistry and human
- 14 development.
- 15 Q. Did you receive any honors or scholarships while you were
- 16 at UNC-Chapel Hill, besides the Robertson Scholarship?
- 17 | A. Yes. I was also a Ron Brown Scholar captain, and I also
- 18 graduated with distinction, and I was an Honors Laureate.
- 19 Q. This case involves UNC's ability to consider race and
- 20 ethnicity in its admissions process.
- 21 Do you identify with a particular race or ethnicity?
- 22 A. Yes, I identify with black/African American.
- 23 Q. And are you originally from the United States?
- 24 A. No. I was actually born in Lubumbashi, Democratic Republic
- 25 \parallel of Congo; and at the age of 3, due to political instability, I

- went to Belgium where I lived for three years and then came to the United States at the age of 6.
- $3 \parallel Q$. And do you speak any languages other than English?
- 4 A. Yes, I am a native French speaker.
- 5 Q. Can you also tell us a bit about your parents' educational
- 6 | background?
- $7 \parallel A$. Yes. So my father is also from the Democratic Republic of
- 8 Congo where he received a medical degree, and after he came to
- 9 the U.S., he redid his residency and received another M.D. so
- 10 he could practice medicine in the United States. And my mother
- 11 received a bachelor's degree in the Democratic Republic of
- 12 Congo.
- 13 Q. I'm going to ask you some questions now about your high
- 14 school experience. I believe that you mentioned you were in a
- 15 | specific magnet program.
- 16 Can you tell us a little bit about that?
- 17 | A. Yes. So Spring Valley High School is actually a public
- 18 school in Columbia, South Carolina; and in middle school,
- 19 you're able to apply for specific magnet programs if your
- 20 academic record allows. And so I decided to attend the math
- 21 | and science magnet, in which there were approximately 30
- 22 | students, and I was one of two black students, with the
- 23 majority of students being either Asian or Caucasian.
- 24 Q. And what was the racial and ethnic makeup of your high
- 25 school more generally?

- More generally, I would say it was pretty evenly split between white and African American. There were very few Latinx 2 3 individuals, as well as Native American individuals.
- 4 Q. And do you believe that your experience as one of two 5 African Americans in the magnet program affected your sense of racial identity? 6
- A. Absolutely. Being primarily from a country in the DRC, Congo, where I was not a minority really did not allow me to see what it meant to be black and what blackness meant in the U.S.; and so when I initially came to North Carolina for middle school and then South Carolina for high school, I had a really big sort of shift in who I believed I was. 12

9

10

11

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

23

24

And, for instance, while I was in high school, you know, oftentimes my -- the fact that I was in advanced coursework, I was either the only black person or one of two, and so at times when I was with my friends or other classmates, people would make comments like, "Oh, you're not black black," or "You are an Oreo. You're black on the outside, but you're white on the inside."

And I really internalized that feeling, and I really wanted to separate myself from my blackness because if my peers were saying that there was something wrong with being black and that having white inside or not being too black was a good thing, then I really wanted to separate myself from that blackness and adopt as white of an identity as I could.

Q. And do you feel that your academic success affected how people treated you in relation to your race?

2

10

11

12

1.3

14

15

16

17

18

22

23

24

25

A. Yes. So I very much believe that my sort of high achieving and academic work resulted in a protective factor in the idea that, you know, I worked really hard at school, and people saw me not just as black Rimel but the really smart one. And so my identity as a black person was kind of stripped from me, and I really took on the identity of a very intelligent person, but that didn't always protect me because, you know, I was involved

with a lot of extracurriculars in high school.

For example, I played lacrosse. So at times when I was in contact with people who didn't know me very well or didn't know me at all is when that protective nature of my academic prowess sort of went away. I had people — people's parents on the lacrosse field yell racial slurs or people that I was playing against who didn't know me sort of make judgments and comments about my race, whereas when I was in class, that wasn't really the thing.

- Q. Overall, do you think that your racial and ethnic identity impacted the perspectives that you developed while you were growing up?
 - A. Yes. As I briefly mentioned before, I really did not want to align with my race. I didn't want -- as ashamed as I am to say it, I didn't want to be black. I -- I am sorry.

THE COURT: Take your time.

1 THE WITNESS: Thank you.

- 2 Q. (By Ms. Turner) Thank you.
- $3 \parallel A$. I'm sorry.

11

12

- 4 Q. Yes. Go on.
- A. I didn't want to be black. I -- you know, there was a point in my life where I asked my mom to give me relaxers so I could make my hair really straight because I really wanted that more Eurocentric look in high school. So even though it burned my scalp, I still did it because I didn't want to be aligned with my blackness. I didn't want my hair to be big. I wanted

to be as far from it as possible because my environment wasn't

13 Q. Thank you, Ms. Mwamba.

one in which blackness was prideful.

- When you applied to UNC-Chapel Hill, did you share anything in your application about your racial identity?
- 16 A. Yes. So I shared my nationality -- my original nationality
- 17 | first, that I am from Congo, and I really wanted to also put
- 18 that I am black/African American because I wanted the schools
- 19 to contextualize my experience and to see that, you know, with
- 20 all the things that I've done in high school and my life, my
- 21 race was a very big part of that identity that I developed.
- 22 Q. And do you think that it was important for UNC to be able
- 23 to consider your racial identity when they were considering
- 24 | your application?
- 25 A. I definitely do. I think one thing about coming to this

- country is seeing how really racialized everything is -right? -- and how subjugation of particular groups across
 history has kind of brought us to where we are today. And I
 think that it's really important, at least for my application,
 that UNC see what -- who I am, you know, holistically and how
 the color of my skin and the texture of my hair impacted my
 upbringing.
 - Q. We've been talking about your racial identity, but I'm going to ask you some questions now about your socioeconomic status.
- When you were in elementary school, how would you describe your parents' socioeconomic status?
 - A. So in elementary school was the time right when we came to the U.S. together, when I was about 6; and so it was me, my older sister, who was 8, and my two parents. And because of the fact that we didn't speak English and that my father was not able to practice medicine because the general U.S. medical laws prevent certain foreigners from practicing without redoing residency, he actually worked as a gas station attendant and a few other, you know, small jobs here and there. And so we did not have much money growing up, particularly in elementary school.
- 23 Q. Did that change over time?

10

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

2.2

A. Yes. So he -- my father, through grit and sheer
determination, was able to relearn medicine, you know, in

- English and pass the medical board exams so that he could go
 into residency and practice medicine again. So by the time we
 moved to I believe South Carolina in 2009, I believe, he was
 able to practice medicine, and so his salary definitely
 increased, and my family and I had a lot more financial
 stability.
- 7 Q. And is your perspective shaped by your socioeconomic 8 identity?

1.3

- A. Yes, it has. I think excuse me. I believe that moving from a pretty low socioeconomic status to a higher one over time definitely gave me a greater perspective not only on what, you know, financial stability meant in the U.S., but also what that looks like for someone like me, an immigrant, because although my father is and was making more money, he still had a lot of responsibility to other members of our family in Congo, you know, who relied on him, both his family and my mother's as well, because he was a primary breadwinner for those people. And, you know, we didn't really have that generational wealth built into our family, and so all the money that he made was spent, you know, kind of paying off debts from our initial time in the U.S. and funding other family members. So it's definitely given me a shift in perspective.
- Q. And given what you just testified about, do you think that your socioeconomic experience is the same or different from students with a similar socioeconomic background but a

- different racial background?
- 2 $\|$ A. I would argue that it's different, and I -- I believe I
- 3 | touched on that a little bit before. But although someone who
- 4 | may be in the same socioeconomic class as me now but different
- 5 | race might have had somewhat similar experiences, I still
- 6 | believe that my background and general racial identity has
- 7 given me a unique perspective and unique life experiences that
- 8 | would not be the same.
- 9 | Q. Can you meaningfully separate your socioeconomic identity
- 10 | from your racial and ethnic identity?
- 11 A. I'm sorry. I didn't quite catch the first part.
- 12 Q. Can you meaningfully separate your socioeconomic identity
- 13 | from your racial and ethnic identity?
- 14 A. No. I say that I have a pretty intersectional identity,
- 15 and it would be hard for me to take the two apart.
- 16 | Q. And I'm going to ask you some questions now about your
- 17 | experience once you were a student at UNC-Chapel Hill.
- 18 When did you begin at UNC, roughly?
- 19 A. I began, I believe, August of 2014.
- 20 \parallel Q. And I believe you testified that you majored in global
- 21 | studies?
- 22 | A. Yes.
- 23 $\|Q$. And why did you choose that major?
- 24 A. Yeah. So I actually came into UNC wanting to be a biology
- 25 \parallel major because I wanted to go into the premedical track. That

was -- you know, what I wanted to do in life is to be a physician, a doctor. And so going in I went in as a biology 2 3 major and then decided to go into global studies because I 4 wanted to expand my idea of the world and my knowledge of it. I knew that either way I would have to take the chemistries, 5 biologies, physics courses that are required to enter medical 6 7 school, and so I wanted to focus my energy and my time also understanding the broader world. 8 Q. While you were a student at UNC, did you have the chance to 9 take classes with students from racially diverse backgrounds? 10 A. I did have that opportunity, although quite a few 11 courses -- given that, as I said before, I was pre-med, so some 12 1.3 of my STEM courses did not have as much diversity as some of my other courses. 14 15 Q. Did the level of racial diversity in a classroom make a difference to your learning environment? 16 17 A. Absolutely. I -- when I think about the classes in which I was surrounded by more diverse people, I happily look back on 18 19 the support that I received in class from my peers and also the 20 sheer knowledge that I gained from them, from understanding and 21 hearing their life experiences, you know, where they're from, 22 where their parents are from, how their upbringing and whatever 23 impacted their current knowledge and their perspectives. 24 And so when I compare that to courses in which there was

in the classroom doesn't always end there, right? There are things happening on the outside world where the hope is that 2 3 you go into the classroom and you forget all about that and you learn how these molecules interact with one another, but then 5 the reality of it is you carry that with you into the classroom. So when things came up that were really impactful 6 to me and my identity, I had to sit in those classes where I saw not many people who looked like me, and it just felt really 8 9 lonely. 10 Q. Did the level of racial diversity in a classroom affect 11 your ability to participate in that class? 12 So there were times when, you know, for me at least, I was the only either person of color, a black person, a black 13 14 woman in a classroom; and there may have been instances in 15 which a comment was made about black people or a comment was made about immigrants; and when I was one of only, if not the 16 17 only, I felt that I had to speak up in defense of everything 18 black and everything immigrant. And so that was very exhausting. So sometimes, you know, I'd take that leap, and 19 20 I'd speak up and engage, but other times I was just so 21 emotionally drained and tired. 2.2 And so when I had other people in the class who also came 23 from diverse backgrounds and who were people of color, I felt 24 way more supported. You know, sometimes you glance over and you look at this person who you know would also speak up, and

- 1 you kind of head nod to each other because you know that they
- 2 | have your back, and you know they're also engaged to support
- 3 | the claim that you're making.
- $4 \parallel Q$. Overall, do you think that there is adequate representation
- 5 of students of color on campus?
- 6 A. No, not at all.
- 7 || Q. Are there any other instances you remember where the lack
- 8 of representation of students of color made a difference to
- 9 your experience?
- 10 A. Absolutely. Outside of the classroom this also happened.
- 11 | For instance, when I got back -- I studied abroad into
- 12 Africa, and then when I came back in the fall of 2016 when
- 13 President Trump was elected and there were tensions on campus,
- 14 | I remember going out to Little Frat Court at UNC to go to a
- 15 party and being stopped at the front door by who I presumed was
- 16 \parallel a fraternity member, a white male, and being told that my
- 17 | president says it's okay to kick out the N words; and then a
- 18 separate incident a few months after when I went to another
- 19 | fraternity party and then being told that no slaves were
- 20 | allowed in.
- 21 And in those moments, really feeling defeated -- angry and
- 22 | frustrated, but also really defeated because around me there
- 23 weren't really other people of color or other black people, and
- 24 so you kind of feel like you're on your own and -- yeah.
- 25 Q. Did you get a chance to participate in extracurricular

activities at UNC where you were in groups of students with more racially diverse backgrounds?

1.3

A. Yes. So I actually had the incredible opportunity to be a part of an online publication called "The Bridge," which is a publication that was created by two women of color, one who identified as black and the other as Latinx, who really wanted to have a platform for black and Latinx and Native American women to be able to express themselves artistically.

And it was one of the few places where I felt really seen and understood and heard because, you know, you'd walk into a meeting of "The Bridge" and see just a plethora of black women, in particular, and Latinx women who were incredibly supportive and who had very unique and amazing life histories that made them diverse as well. So even within the black community you had such flagrant diversity and — of experience and background.

You know, for the first time in my life, I really came to understand the livelihood of, you know, black Latinx women, who I never interacted with before, but their very unique outlook on life and experiences with that identity.

And so I felt really happy and really supported in that space.

And another -- another extracurricular that I was able to commit to was rugby, where I got an incredible opportunity to play with, you know, femme-identifying individuals who were of

very diverse sexual orientations and even races as well, where I really came to understand the plight of people who are both similar and different to me.

1.3

2.2

And so those two spaces were very -- if those two places didn't exist for me at my time at UNC, I'm not really sure how long I would have lasted because they served to reignite my passion for education and for being around others and for learning in that environment.

Q. You testified earlier about how your experiences in high school affected your racial identity and sense of self.

Did your sense of racial and ethnic identity change while you were at UNC-Chapel Hill?

A. Yes, I can very happily say that I grew more into myself at Chapel Hill, and I guess an example of that would be -- I know I touched upon the idea that I used to relax my hair a lot in high school and middle school, you know, for the purpose of appearing more Eurocentric.

I got to college. My second year I cut all my hair off, and I -- I grew it out, you know, in a way that I was proud because I had seen so many amazing, beautiful, you know, black women on campus who were proud of their hair and their crowns and who taught me how to take care of and love mine.

And so as I interacted with other black women, but also other women and people of color in general, I was able to be proud of my skin color and really be proud of my identity and

not shy away from it, you know, be insulted at the idea of being an Oreo, because I'm black on the inside too, and that's great.

Q. Thank you.

1.3

And I'm sorry to bring this up again, Ms. Mwamba, but you described being called a slave.

Was the historical legacy of slavery at UNC-Chapel Hill a particularly salient issue while you were attending?

A. Yes. So actually, while I was at UNC there were — there were conversations about Silent Sam far before I got there as well, but I know that when I got to campus, those conversations really began to ignite again. Silent Sam is the Confederate monument on UNC's campus that brought a lot of emotional, psychological, and even physical stress to my community, at least the black community. And so while I was on campus, there were larger conversations happening about what it meant to have a Confederate soldier on UNC's campus.

And, you know, as a black person, you ask yourself does this school actually value my being here by allowing, you know, a statue that commemorates such a violent history towards black people. And so as those conversations were going on, there were also rallies, and, you know, I remember instances in which you'd get -- I'd get text messages from other black friends saying, "Hey, be careful. You know, the Sons of the Confederacy are on campus. If you can, go home another way, go

- home another route." Because the spaces were just really, you know, emotionally and physically violent surrounding Silent 2 3
- 4 Thank you.

Sam.

8

10

11

13

16

17

18

19

20

21

5 And just to finish, I'm going to ask you a few questions 6 about the future.

7 What are you doing currently?

- A. Yeah. So currently I am a research fellow at the Duke Global Health Institute, along with a research specialist at the Duke Department of Psychiatry and Behavioral Sciences, where I'm doing really awesome research that deals with HIV among pregnant women in Moshi, Tanzania, and also deals with 12 the impact of HIV and drug use on the anatomy of the brain.
- Q. And do you have plans that were affected by the coronavirus 14 pandemic? 15
- A. Yes. So I was actually supposed to go and finish out my project in Tanzania in May, but because of the virus, I had to stay here, although I am doing a good bit of work remotely; and I was also expected to go to the University of Utah in the hopes of being a coordinator for a research project on diarrheal diseases in Ghana and Bangladesh, but unfortunately, that project did not start because of the virus. 22
- 23 Q. And are you considering seeking further education for yourself? 24
- Yes. I'm actually in the mix of the medical school

- application cycle, and luckily I have been accepted to a few medical schools that I will pick one and attend in the fall of 2021.
- $4 \parallel Q$. Is there one that you're particularly interested in?
- A. I am really interested in the Emory School of Medicine, as well as UChicago School of Medicine, because in my interviews, they very passionately spoke about their entire racist initiatives and their student bodies; and, you know, faculty and staff were very diverse and really put diversity at the forefront of their mission because they believe that a diverse set of physicians will be able to, you know, engage positively
- 14 Q. Congratulations.
- 15 A. Thank you.

that.

12

13

16 $\|Q$. More broadly, what are your long-term goals for the future?

with a diverse patient population. So I'm really happy about

- 17 A. Yeah, so I really hope to practice medicine. I'm not
- 18 entirely sure of which specialty I want to go into, although
- 19 | from my past work I'm really passionate about infectious
- 20 disease with medicine and research because I want to find
- 21 | clinical interventions and develop them that really work to
- 22 | address healthcare disparities both in the U.S. and outside of
- 23 | it borders.
- 24 | Q. And do you think that your experiences with racial and
- 25 ethnic diversity at UNC-Chapel Hill impacted your ability to

achieve those goals? I -- again, I look back on my time on UNC, though not 2 3 perfect, and understand that the people that I met and the 4 experiences that I've had have shaped my perspective as to what 5 kind of doctor I want to be and as a doctor that, you know, has a really diverse patient population, who I know how to treat 6 7 and how to talk to and how to care for, because I understand that their unique life experiences make them a holistic person, 8 9 and I really want to address every part of their being, you 10 know, not just the clinical part, but also the psychological and emotional aspects of being who they are. 11 12 Thank you, Ms. Mwamba. 13 MS. TURNER: We have no further questions for this 14 witness. 15 THE COURT: All right. Questions? MR. HASSAN: No further questions. Just would like to 16 thank the witness for sharing. 17 18 MS. HENDERSON: No further questions, but I would like to thank Ms. Mwamba for her testimony. 19 20 THE COURT: Thank you. 21 Thank you so much, and you are released at this time. 2.2 MS. TURNER: Your Honor, subject to the Court's 23 admission of Intervenors' exhibits, we have no further witnesses at this time. 24 25 THE COURT: All right. Thank you.

```
(The witness left the stand.)
 2
             THE COURT: Well, it looks as though we have a little
 3
   time before -- I'm assuming that the others are looking to
 4
    start their closing arguments after lunch.
        Is that your understanding?
 5
6
             MR. HASSAN: That's correct. Yes, Your Honor.
 7
             THE COURT: All right. So why don't we -- first of
8
   all, let me admit all of your records at this time on the
9
   record.
10
             MS. TURNER: Thank you, Your Honor.
             THE COURT: And that completes your case; is that
11
12
   correct?
13
             MS. TURNER: That's correct, Your Honor. Thank you.
             THE COURT: All right. Are there any matter -- other
14
15
   matters that we need to discuss before we recess?
        Then we will recess until 1:30, and so we will resume at
16
17
   that time. Thank you.
18
        Let us recess court.
19
        (A noon recess was taken from 12:05 p.m. until 1:30 p.m.;
   all parties present.)
20
21
        (The closing arguments occurred next and will be filed
22
   under separate cover with the court.)
23
24
25
```

CERTIFICATE I, LORI RUSSELL, RMR, CRR, United States District Court Reporter for the Middle District of North Carolina, DO HEREBY CERTIFY: That the foregoing is a true and correct transcript of the proceedings had in the within-entitled action; that I reported the same in stenotype to the best of my ability and thereafter reduced same to typewriting through the use of Computer-Aided Transcription. Lori Russell, RMR, CRR Date: 12/16/2020 Official Court Reporter 2.2